

**PROCEEDINGS**  
OF THE  
**1<sup>ST</sup> ANNUAL CONFERENCE**  
OF THE  
**SOCIETY FOR MUSICOLOGY IN**  
**IRELAND**

**NUI MAYNOOTH, 2-3 MAY 2003**

Edited by Barra Boydell

*Society for Musicology in Ireland*  
*Aontas Ceoleolaíochta na hÉireann*

[www.music.ucc.ie/smi](http://www.music.ucc.ie/smi)

Published by the Society for Musicology in Ireland in association with the  
Department of Music, NUI Maynooth, Co. Kildare, Ireland.

Publication date: May 2004  
Place of publication: Maynooth

© the individual contributors, 2004

Copies of these proceedings may be purchased from the Society for Musicology in  
Ireland through their website: [www.music.ucc.ie/smi](http://www.music.ucc.ie/smi)  
or from the Dept of Music, NUI Maynooth.

## ABSTRACTS AND CONFERENCE PROGRAMME

This programme lists all papers presented at the conference, including abstracts of those papers not submitted for the Proceedings. The institutional affiliation of individual speakers is that pertaining at the time of the conference.

### FRIDAY 2 MAY, 2003

#### 11.30-1.00 Session A: Nineteenth Century Piano Music

Chair: Patrick Devine

Una Hunt (NUI Maynooth)

*The Piano Writing of Irish Virtuoso, George Alexander Osborne*

[See Proceedings, pages 95-103 above]

Jacqueline Waeber (TCD)

*Virtuosity versus Programme Music: Charles-Valentin Alkan's Souvenirs. Trois Morceaux dans le genre pathétique op. 15*

Originality and marginality are notions widely used to view the French composer and piano virtuoso Charles-Valentin Alkan (1813-1888). They also provide a basis for categorizing him as a Romantic *rara avis*, thereby dismissing most of the artistic value of his work. Yet in the light of some recent research devoted to key concepts of Romantic musical aesthetics, notably questions of genre and virtuosity, Alkan's position must be seriously reconsidered (see respectively the milestone study by Jeffrey Kallberg, 'The Rhetoric of Genre: Chopin's Nocturne in G minor', *Chopin at the Boundaries*, Cambridge (MA), 1996, 1<sup>st</sup> publ. in 1988, and Jim Samson, *Virtuosity and the Musical Work: The Transcendental Studies of Liszt* (Cambridge, 2003)).

The core of my paper focusses on Alkan's *Souvenirs. Trois Morceaux dans le genre pathétique* op. 15 for piano (published together with nine other piano pieces, the whole gathered in four "recueils" under the general title of *Grandes Études* in 1837, the same year as Liszt's own *Grandes Études*, the first version of the *Transcendentals*). My aim is to shed new light on some precise aspects of what Kallberg has labelled "generic ambivalence" and to demonstrate the paradoxical relationship between virtuosity and program music.

Adele Commins (NUI Maynooth)

*'Too Thorough an Irishman [and] Lacks the Oceanic Depth of German Sentiment': Stanford's Assimilation of Contemporary European Trends in Piano Music*

[See Proceedings, pages 104-17 above]

**11.30-1.00 Session B: Musicology, Irish Music, and Education**

Chair: Fintan Vallely

Derek Cremin (University College Cork)

*Musicology and its Implications on the W.W.W*

This paper looks at attempts to transfer certain aspects of musicology into an online context, their successes, failures and some possible solutions for future use under the headings of graphical, textual and aural.

Sean Corcoran (NUI Maynooth)

*'Irish (Traditional) Music' and Musicology*

Terminology, definition and identification have long been problematic in the field of music generally and few more so than the conceptualisation of "Irish music", beginning in the early nineteenth century with connotations of "ancientness" and developing into its present densely luxuriant semantic field of "tradition", "heritage", "folk" and "celticism". This paper looks at the actual socio-musical practices upon which these concepts are based and re-assesses the approaches of the established fields of scholarship – folk-musicology, ethnomusicology, Celtic Studies and Cultural Studies - which have historically focused on these practices and the general musicological implications involved.

Evelyn Grant (University College Cork)

*Social Inclusion in Music Education in Ireland.*

“If personal and social meanings are not merely contextual variables, but are themselves part of musical content, segregating musical meanings from personal and social ones is no longer something we can do in good conscience.” (Bowman 2002)

This paper addresses the issue of communities who do not enjoy equality of access and opportunity in music education and training in Ireland. It examines current attitudes and priorities in providing a socially inclusive system of music education. Everitt (1997) discusses the fact that there has long been discord between the claims of participation and of performance – ‘that fun and social bonding should not be confused with art.’ Does this discord hinder attempts to redress the situation of social exclusion? McClary (1987) argues the need for music to be re-examined through the lens of socio-political consideration. What repercussions does such examination have for the training of musicians who will attempt to deliver music education in under-served communities in the future?

“The people to whom music educators are responsible – students and their communities – must understand that their need for music is being met by professionals aware of what that need is and competent to help fulfil it.” (Reimer 2000)

**2.00-3.30 Session A: Nineteenth Century Austro-German Music**

Chair: Michael Murphy

Sinead Dempsey (Univ. of Manchester)

*Composer and Critic: The Mendelssohn-Marx Relationship Reconsidered*

[See Proceedings, pages 65-71 above]

Wolfgang Marx (University College Dublin)

*Religious, but without Religion? Robert Schumann's Requiem Op. 148*

[See Proceedings, pages 72-82 above]

Julian Horton (University College Dublin)

*The 'Bruckner Problem' and its Analytical Consequences*

[See Proceedings, pages 83-94 above]

**Session B: Cathedral Music**

Chair: Barra Boydell

Triona O'Hanlon (NUI Maynooth)

*Lewis Gibson and 'Miss Mathews': Two Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Century Provincial Irish Cathedral Composers and the Editing of their Works*

[See Proceedings, pages 41-7 above]

Kerry Houston (NUI Maynooth)

*Misattributions and Mysteries: an Examination of the Dangers of Over Dependence on Single Sources or a Small Representation of Sources in the Identification and Dating of Repertoire*

The eighteenth-century music library at St Patrick's cathedral is used as an example of a source group which has been overlooked by many and which overturns some previously accepted attributions for seventeenth- and eighteenth-century repertoire on both sides of the Irish Sea. The paper outlines the type of investigation required to verify works lists for composers such as Henry Purcell, Jeremiah Clarke, William Croft and the Roseingraves.

Denise Neary (Canterbury Christ Church University College)

*A Canterbury Tale: a Musical Foundation in the Eighteenth Century*

[See Proceedings, pages 50-64 above]

**4.00-5.30 Session A: Strauss, Sibelius and Schoenberg**

Chair: Gareth Cox

Philip Graydon (Queen's University Belfast)

Ein Vorgestriger Nachromantiker [*An Outdated Post-Romantic*]?: *Richard Strauss and the 1920s*

Though his *oeuvre* had been considered the quintessence of modernity at the *fin-de-siècle*, by 1924, Richard Strauss merely personified the perpetuation of an art that 'remained true to the old health' (G. Hauptmann). This paper discusses the resultant historiographical bias, and, in examining both man and music, finds a figure arguably as much of his time as Schoenberg or Stravinsky.

Eibhlín Griffin (Mary Immaculate College Limerick/WIT)

*Rotational Form and Sibelius*

[See Proceedings, pages 124-30 above]

Ciaran Crilly (University College Dublin)

*Painting, Colour and Narrative in the Music of Arnold Schoenberg*

Having attended a concert of Arnold Schoenberg's music in 1911, Franz Marc wrote: 'Can you imagine a music in which the tonality (that is, the holding to some kind of tonal system) is completely lifted? When listening to this music, which lets every tone struck stand for itself (a kind of white canvas between the colour spots!), I had to think continually of Kandinsky's great *Composition*, which also allows no trace of tonal system.' The cross-fertilization of art forms that Marc describes constitutes a distinctive and uniquely productive characteristic of *Fin de Siècle* Viennese culture. Within weeks of this concert, Kandinsky had initiated a fruitful and lengthy correspondence with the composer in which a creative affinity was to become increasingly apparent. The importance of the relationship is illustrated by Schoenberg's contributions as a composer, writer and painter to the *Blaue Reiter Almanac*. Central to parallels in their artistic evolution in the years preceding the Great War are two dramas synthetically fused by colour-light plots, Kandinsky's *Der gelbe Klang* and Schoenberg's *Die gluckliche Hand*. These stage works represent one extreme of interdisciplinary experimentation which would profoundly alter how the composer and painter developed within their respective media.

This paper aims to demonstrate how Schoenberg's absorption of non-musical aesthetics, particularly those of painting, impacted upon his quest to establish an autonomous grammar of free atonality. At a time when traditional organising principles were collapsing, many artists attempted to apply musical ideals to their canvases. Conversely, Schoenberg employed painting and colour as a scaffold, to be dismantled once it had performed the function of midwife to the birth of a new

music. By focusing on his *Five Orchestral Pieces* Op. 16 (1909), I shall re-appraise the commonly asserted comparison between the devolution of tonality in music and the devolution of the object in painting in terms of musical narrativity and text. A reading of Aristotelian plot structure, which is suggested by the designation of the title '*Peripeteia*' to the fourth of the pieces, lends force to the argument. The issues surrounding Op.16 exemplify a substantial epistemic shift, culminating in Schoenberg's discovery of the twelve-tone method of composition.

#### **4.00-5.30 Session B: Chant, and Music in Medieval and Renaissance Ireland**

Chair: Gerard Gillen

Oscar Mascareñas Garza (Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick)  
*A System of Ornamental Procedures for Gregorian Chant: Some Progresses.*  
*Case Study: Variants in Standard Formulas of Second-Mode Tracts – Casual or Causal?*

The purpose of this paper is to present the results of the analysis of certain variants that occur in standard formulas of second-mode tracts. This analysis was made in order to search for what I will refer to as a “system of ornamental procedures” for Gregorian chant. The proposed system will treat these variants as the result of the application of certain procedures regulated by specific cues and constraints. In the first three sections, I will examine some of the methods of comparative analysis that have been applied to the study of the notation of the earliest Gregorian manuscripts. Then I will provide a brief review of some of the important concepts proposed by Leo Treitler towards an understanding of the definition of standard formulas and the way they were viewed by singers in the oral stage of the transmission of Gregorian Chant. After that, I will propose a new perspective for comparative analysis that will lead me to formulate a theory concerning the existence of a system of ornamental procedures.

Ann Buckley (Univ. of Cambridge/Univ. of Paris IV-Sorbonne)  
*Music of the medieval Irish church*

[See Proceedings, pages 20-8 above]

Barra Boydell (NUI Maynooth) and Maire Buffet (University College Dublin)  
*An Early Seventeenth-Century Library from Ulster: Books on Music in the Collection of Lord Edward Conway (1602-1655)*

[See Proceedings, pages 29-39 above]

**5.45-6.30 Lecture Recital**

**John Feeley, guitar (NUI Maynooth)**

'sting like a bee ...' (1998), movt 1	David Fennessy
'Fantasia' and 'Night Song' from <i>Three Pieces for Guitar</i> (1973)	Brian Boydell
<i>Sonata no. 2 for Solo Guitar</i> (1998), movts 2, 3 and 4	John Buckley

**7.00:** Reception and Launch by composer John Buckley of *Irish Music in the Twentieth Century* edited by Gareth Cox & Axel Klein, Irish Musical Studies, vol. 7 (Four Courts Press)

**SATURDAY 3 MAY**

**9.30-10.45 Session A: Eighteenth Century Music**

Chair: Martin Adams

Anne Leahy (Dublin Institute of Technology)

*'Vor deinen Thron tret ich': the Eschatological Significance of J.S. Bach's 'Leipzig' Chorales*

The chorale preludes found in the manuscript *P271* have been variously known as the 'Great Eighteen', the 'Seventeen', the chorale preludes from the Leipzig Manuscript and the 'Leipzig' chorales. The first fifteen (BWV 651–665) are in the hand of Bach, the following two (BWV 666–667) in the hand of Bach's son-in-law Johann Christoph Altnickol and the final incomplete chorale prelude (BWV 668) in the hand of an as-yet unidentified scribe. Almost all of the chorale preludes were revised by Bach in Leipzig during the last decade of his life, with the original first versions dating from the Weimar period. The final 10–12 years of Bach's life was a time of consolidation as evidenced by the completion of *Clavierübung* III, the Art of Fugue, the *Schübler Chorales*, the assembling of the B Minor Mass and the revision of the 'Leipzig' chorales. It may be that Bach was preparing a fair copy of these chorale preludes for publication, but why did he put these compositions together in the first place? Hans Klotz, the editor of Volume 2 of the organ works in the *Neue Bach Ausgabe* believes that Bach only intended there to be 17 chorale preludes in this collection, since in *P271* the first 17 are separated from the 18th by the Canonic Variations. The German musicologist Ulrich Meyer agrees with this proposal while also saying that there is no unifying musical theme. Theories that these works were intended as *musica sub communione* have been put forward by Helene Werthemann, Casper Honders and Robin A. Leaver. Many more scholars such as Werner Breig and Christoph Wolff believe that Bach intended there to be 18 chorale preludes in this collection, although they do not offer reasons as to why Bach put these pieces together.

In order to try to discern Bach's possible intentions it is necessary to fully investigate the theological background to the hymn texts chosen by Bach for these



compositions. A common thread emerges from the texts of all hymns used in this collection—they indicate that Bach may have been assembling a collection of compositions bound by an eschatological theme. It becomes clear that Bach did indeed intend the final composition BWV 668 to be part of this collection. It is inextricably bound to the other 17 by both theological and musical means. To date no research has offered a satisfactory solution to the intentions of Bach with regard to the ‘Leipzig’ chorales. This paper will show how Bach portrays his preoccupation with eschatology, sending strong theological messages using musical methods in a manner that leaves one in no doubt as to his own personal faith in salvation.

David Rhodes (Waterford Institute of Technology)

*The Viola da Gamba, its repertory and practitioners in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century*

At the 1998 annual conference of the Irish Chapter of the Royal Musical Association held at the University of Ulster (Jordanstown), I presented a paper entitled ‘Back to the coal face – some anachronistic late-eighteenth century music for viola da gamba’. A small number of works had emerged in the post-Abelian period that extended the performing life of the instrument well beyond the time when it was generally believed to have ceased altogether (prior to its modern revival). Subsequent research has proved that, far from being an anachronism, this repertory is in fact far more substantial in quantity and geographically widespread than was hitherto thought to have been the case, with active professional practitioners in various European countries continuing to perform until at least 1817. Whether this newly unearthed mature-Classical era repertory of gamba music will be accepted by modern performers long accustomed to earlier and frequently less technically demanding fare, only time will tell. The available evidence suggests that this is indeed already taking place, with the publication of various editions and the first commercially available CD recording.

### **9.30-10.45 Session B: European Nationalism**

Chair: Julian Horton

Maria Escribano (Irish World Music Centre, Univ. of Limerick)

*Txalaparta and Euskara. Music and language, hand in hand with the making of identity.*

A particular instrument shows in Basque Country, like no other, the revolutionary endeavour and attitude of a sector of the Basque population within the struggle for the independence of Euskal Herria. *Abertzaleak* have chosen to identify through, and make a symbol of, *txalaparta*, a percussion instrument of unknown origins, like Basque language itself. *Txalaparta* has become, in close relationship with Euskara, a strong exponent of Basque identity. However, the phenomenon of *txalaparta*, in a symbiotic relationship between music and culture, seems to disclose a musical path along the lines of a nationalism clearly influenced by left wing ideologies.

I wish to offer an insight on the way radical left wing nationalism is musically articulated through *txalaparta* and explore the seemingly strong link between the revival of *txalaparta* and the revival of Basque language, Euskara.

Michael Murphy (Mary Immaculate College Limerick)  
*Genre and Romantic Ideology in Moniuszko's Halka*

[See Proceedings, pages 118-23 above]

### 11.15-12.15 Session A: Baroque Opera and Dance

Chair: Harry White

Martin Adams (TCD)

*"Opera is when a Guy Gets Stabbed in the Back and, Instead of Bleeding, He Sings"*

This quip by the American comedian Ed Gardner (1901–63) captures opera's irrational aspects rather more memorably than any eloquent disquisition. But behind the humour lurks a serious point. For many European countries in the 17th century, coming to terms with opera meant coming to terms with concepts of theatre which stood in direct opposition to their native traditions of spoken theatre. Nowhere was this a more difficult issue than in 17th-century England.

One of the few 17th-century English writers who had anything to say about opera was John Dryden — England's greatest poet and dramatist of the last half of that century. And most of what he said was negative, focusing on the contrast between the naturalistic drama he admired and the "senseless" and "empty" qualities of opera. Yet Dryden supplied the librettos for two of the most important operatic works of that time, *Albion and Albanus* (1685, music by Louis Grabu) and *King Arthur* (1691, music by Henry Purcell).

This paper will explore the contradictions of Dryden's position, and attempt to understand how, in his librettos, he attempted to reconcile these aspects. It will also consider some of the points in common between Dryden's solutions and those adopted in other countries, notably Spain.

Sarah McCleave (Queen's University Belfast)  
*The Gestural World of Marie Sallé*

Marie Sallé (1707-1756) was a highly expressive dancer whose reforms to the codified style of *la belle danse* inspired composers such as G.F. Handel and J.P. Rameau to respond with appropriately gestural music. We must rely on written accounts by theatrical professionals such as Jean Georges Noverre or Louis Cahusac to appreciate Sallé's work, for there are no notational or iconographical sources.

Contemporaries commented on Sallé's 'voluptuous' arms while referring to her use of 'attitudes': this paper will consider treatises and iconographical sources which may help us to understand her gestural style while also considering the role of 'narrative' in her work. The difficulties in reading theatrical theorists at 'face value' will be discussed.

### **11.15-12.15 Session B: Irish Traditional Music**

Chair: Sean Corcoran

Adrian Scahill (University College Dublin)  
*The Piano in the Early Céilí Band*

The re-invention and promotion of céilí dancing by the Gaelic League in the first half of the twentieth century precipitated the emergence of a new form of ensemble playing in traditional Irish music, namely the céilí (originally ceilidh or ceilidhe) band. From the outset the piano was a fundamental instrument of the band, and remains so to this day. By outlining the accompanimental techniques employed by the pianists of these bands, the paper illustrates the wide variety of styles which existed at this nascent stage of the céilí band's development. The approaches to accompaniment and arrangement which existed in the 'orchestra-type' bands will be compared with those of the more traditional ensembles. The paper will attempt to show that the standardisation of the céilí band by the 1950s was reflected in the homogenisation of piano styles during the same period. Finally, a reassessment of the importance of the pianist within the genre will be made, challenging the perception that the pianist was removed from the other 'traditional' players, and hence outside the tradition to an extent.

Fintan Vallely (Academy For Irish Cultural Heritages, University of Ulster)  
*Scenting the paper rose: The Ulster Scots quest for music as identity*

[See Proceedings, pages 131-6 above]

### **12.30: Keynote address**

Chair: Barra Boydell

Derek Scott (Professor of Music, University of Salford)  
*From the Erotic to the Demonic: Scaling the Heights and Plumbing the Depths of Musicology.*

[See Proceedings, pages 1-19 above]

**2.30-4.00 Session A: Twentieth-Century Music – Ireland and France** Chair: Martin O’Leary

Gareth Cox (Mary Immaculate College Limerick)  
*Darmstadt Revisited? Seóirse Bodley’s News from Donabate (1999)*

[See Proceedings, pages 137-42 above]

Hazel Farrell (Waterford Institute of Technology)  
*Minimalism in Irish Contemporary Composition: Eric Sweeney’s String Quartet (1996)*

[See Proceedings, pages 143-50 above]

Paul McNulty (University of Durham)  
*René Leibowitz’s Attack on Messiaen: an Unintentional Influence?*

Leibowitz could be described as Messiaen’s arch-rival, as he managed to procure some of the latter’s most gifted students, including Boulez, in the mid 1940s. His main concern was to revive serial music and establish it as the new international language of music. Boulez’s polemical articles of the late 1940s clearly illustrated that the quest for a new compositional language had gained considerable momentum. His comment that Messiaen “juxtaposes rather than composes” is indicative of a man prepared to challenge all schools of thought. Leibowitz had influential friends in Paris – including Sartre, who edited *Les temps modernes* – and began to write highly charged articles for various journals. Articles on Bartók and Stravinsky were to follow his 1945 article in *L’Arche*: “Olivier Messiaen ou l’Hédonisme Empirique dans la Musique Contemporaine”. In this article Leibowitz critiqued Messiaen’s recent treatise – *Technique de mon langage musical* – using language bordering on the vitriolic. This paper will outline his central criticisms, place these in the context of Messiaen’s evolving language, and hypothesise that despite ridiculing and denigrating Messiaen (and perhaps trying to undermine his career), Leibowitz actually played a crucial role in Messiaen’s emergence several years later as a leader of the avant-garde.

**2.30-4.00 Session B: Viewing the Past – Nineteenth Century Editing and Performance**

Chair: Anne Leahy

Yo Tomita (Queen’s University Belfast)  
*Pursuit of Perfection: Stages of Revision in Wesley and Horn’s ‘New and Correct’ Edition of Bach’s ‘48’*

Wesley and Horn’s edition of Bach’s Well-Tempered Clavier (1810-13) was the first edition of this work to be edited critically in England. It was also the first ‘analysed’

edition and it contained an introduction in which the editors stressed the accuracy of its text. My examination of its surviving specimens indicates that it was revised many times, not only to the musical text but also the details of the title-page and the list of subscribers. Through the detailed study of these revisions, I seek answers to the following questions: What prompted Wesley and Horn to revise their edition? Can specific revisions be explained by events in their lives? Are there noticeable shifts in Wesley's approach to revisions over the years? If so, what do they imply?

Fiona M. Palmer (Queen's University Belfast)

*'This Sort of Music is not so Generally Cultivated': Vincent Novello, the University of Cambridge and the Fitzwilliam Music (1825)*

Vincent Novello's association with the Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge preoccupied him in the mid-1820s. The story of his access to, negotiations over, and dissemination of, the music manuscripts from the Fitzwilliam Collection, is fascinating. It reveals not only a great deal about the protocols of negotiation at the time but also the editorial and publishing processes he employed. Critical to the discussion is a document which became the basis of Novello's publishing proposal to the Senate. This letter contains nuggets of information that shed light on the prevailing attitudes towards 'ancient' repertoire and the consumption of printed music in England.

Elaine Kelly (University of Edinburgh)

*'Faced with the Local Critics, a Bach Work has a Difficult Time': Brahms as a Performer of Baroque Choral and Keyboard Music.*

Brahms was an avid scholar of earlier musics and through his work as a performer and editor did much to advance the cause of the early-music revival in the 19<sup>th</sup>-century. This paper will focus on Brahms's performances of baroque choral and keyboard music, placing them within the wider context of the revivalist movement. It will examine the reception of Brahms's concerts and will determine his perception of baroque performance practices. In particular, the paper will explore his stance on the question of authenticity in performance, centring on issues that were particularly contentious in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, such as the debate surrounding continuo realisation.

#### **4.30: Annual General Meeting of the Society for Musicology in Ireland**

End of Conference